Oksana Vivchar

West Ukrainian National University, Ukraine ORCID: 0000-0001-9246-2226

Yuliia Muravska

West Ukrainian National University, Ukraine ORCID: 0000-0002-9695-1075

NATO-UKRAINE COOPERATION AS AN IMPORTANT MECHANISM FOR COUNTERACTING HYBRID WARFARE

Introduction

The dynamic development of scientific thought suggests that armed conflicts pose a significant threat to humanity due to the possible expansion of the number of participants in the context of globalization. The issue of resolving armed conflicts is relevant and plays an important role in the system of modern international relations. Opinions of the Ukraine-NATO cooperation concept differ in many directions. The aim of this thesis is to define the problems connected to the civil view of such cooperation, which concerns not only the considerations of the military methods for combating hybrid warfare, but in the final result also non-military. Hybrid warfare, as a phenomenon, and the Ukraine-NATO cooperation, as the result of rational international decisions taken, are the main features of modern security system.

It is proved that in modern conditions one of the most important tasks of state building in Ukraine is the formation of a strong defense potential and the creation of an effective security and defense sector. The civilized choice of the Ukrainian people is to move towards integration, and it requires a review of the principles of all military formations functioning, in particular the Armed Forces of Ukraine. Today, the partnership of the Armed Forces of Ukraine with NATO structures is carried out in many areas and has a significant number of organizational and legal forms. One of the most important factors in increasing the effectiveness of the Ukrainian army is the perception and practical implementation of the North Atlantic Alliance standards. Taking into account the complexity of this process, we support the opinion of scientist about *«...the scientific analysis importance of organizational and legal adaptation of the Armed Forces of Ukraine management principles and standards to NATO standards as an important mechanism for combating hybrid warfare»*¹.

The purpose of this article is to review the literature topic, as well as the current situation of Ukraine-NATO cooperation, the hybrid warfare, as well as additional and alternative forms of security policy. The following methods of scientific research are used in the paper: generalization and systematization (for the basics of cooperation between Ukraine and NATO), methods of induction and deduction (for analysing the non-military methods for combating hybrid warfare), as well as content analysis (when clarifying the essence of the Ukraine-NATO cooperation).

Some problematic issues in the Ukraine-NATO cooperation are highlighted in the scientific works of domestic and foreign scholars. The works of Andrushkiv B., Vivchar O. (Andrushkiv B., Vivchar O. 2009), Abramov V., Borysevych S. Datsiuk A. (Abramov V., Borysevych S., Datsiuk A. 2019), Aleksandrov O. (Aleksandrov O. 2018), Vivchar O. (Vivchar O. 2018), V. Martynyuk , Muravska Y. (Martynyuk V., Muravska Y. 2020) reflect a lot of attention paid to the problems of combating hybrid warfare. Despite the large number of scientific works and significant achievements in the theory and practice of combating hybrid warfare, certain issues remain a constant object of discussion. Yet the mechanism of for combating hybrid warfare seems to be lacking the attention of scientists.

Prerequisites of cooperation between Ukraine and NATO

Cooperation between Ukraine and NATO covers a wide range of areas: peacekeeping operations, security and defence transformation, direct military cooperation and armaments, civil emergency planning, science and environment, and public diplomacy. Talking about the hybrid war, cooperation in many areas is now intensifying in order to increase Ukraine's ability to guarantee its own security. It should be noted that «... Ukraine has sufficient political and legal preconditions for full institutional rapprochement with the North Atlantic Alliance»².

Nowadays, the North Atlantic Alliance plays an important role in international security area:

¹ V. Abramov, S. Borysevych, A. Datsiuk, Zabezpechennia natsionalnoi bezpeky Ukrainy v umovakh vkhodzhennia Ukrainy do Yevropeiskoho ta Yevroatlantychnoho prostoriv: monohrafiia [Ensuring the national security of Ukraine in terms of Ukraine's entry into the European and Euro-Atlantic spaces: a monograph], NADU Kyiv 2019, p.9.

²O. Vivchar, Upravlinnia ekonomichnoiu bezpekoiu pidpryiemstv: sotsiohumanitarni konteksty [Management of economic security of enterprises: socio-humanitarian contexts], FOP Palianytsia, Ternopil 2018, p. 89.

- ensures the security of each member country of the Alliance,
- forms a system of collective security,
- creates partnerships with non-NATO countries,
- establishes and applies the mechanisms for non-violent overcoming Crisis and conflicts,
- performs humanitarian, scientific, educational functions, which show that NATO exists not only for military purposes.

The hybrid aggression formed against Ukraine created new threats for NATO member states, which required the strengthening of NATO-Ukraine cooperation, especially in non-military spheres. In such conditions, Ukraine needs more assistance from the Alliance; however, it has already become a source of knowledge and experience in hybrid warfare combating. *«…integration processes combine stimulating and protective factors, as international unions do not accept all applicants, but only those that meet high indicators of economic development, legal systems and the social sphere»*³.

The hybrid nature of the aggression against Ukraine has proved that military force does not play an exceptionally decisive role. Therefore, counteraction to such aggression should be not only military, but comprehensive, with a wide range of non-military means.

Today's such cooperation is in fact evolving into a joint response to hybrid threats, which should further focus on such key non-military areas, in particular:

- countering emergencies;
- scientific and technical cooperation;
- inter-parliamentary cooperation;
- political cooperation;
- countering cyber threats;
- energy security;
- development of civilian personnel in the security area;
- development of values of democracy, individual freedom and rule of law, etc.

At the same time, the «...Euro-Atlantic integration process should involve not only law enforcement agencies responsible for security and defence, but also other ministries and agencies, as this policy is state policy»⁴.

³ V. Martynyuk , Y. Muravska, Forming a foreign trade partnership strategy in the context of strengthening national economic security: A case study of Ukraine, "Forum Scientiae Oeconomia", Warszawa, 2020, Vol 8 No 2 (2020), P. 5-24; http://ojs.wsb.edu.pl/index.php/fso/article/view/296/237, accessed: 14.11.2021.

⁴ B. Andrushkiv, O. Vivchar, Problemy teorii i praktyky menedzhmentu : navch.-metodych. posibn. [Problems of theory and practice of management textbook]. Terno-Graf LLC, Ternopil 2009, p. 76.

Presumptions of Ukraine's membership in NATO

Cooperation with the Alliance in non-military areas provides an additional opportunity to develop the mechanism of modern hybrid challenges and threats early warning and counteraction. Its importance was noted by Ukrainian experts who took part in a survey conducted in January 2020⁵, that the main argument, for those who support Ukraine's membership in NATO, is the guarantee of security - 76% of membership supporters answered that way; 34% believe that it will help to resist Russian aggression and return the occupied territories; 32% - that it will help to strengthen the army. Among those who oppose membership, the most compelling argument: for 47% - is that Ukraine may be involved in NATO warfare, and 30% continue to consider the Alliance as an "aggressive military bloc".

Since the NATO Warsaw Summit in July 2016, NATO's practical assistance to Ukraine has been provided in the form of the Comprehensive Assistance Package (CAP) to Ukraine⁶:

- In June 2017, the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine (Supreme Council of Ukraine) adopted legislation, identifying the country's membership in the Alliance as a strategic priority of the national foreign and security policy. In 2019, the relevant amendment to the Constitution of Ukraine came into force;
- In September 2020, The President of Ukraine Volodymyr Zelenskyy declared his readiness to give a new impetus to the development of relations between Ukraine and NATO and approved Ukraine's new National Security Strategy;
- From 12 June 2020, Ukraine is one of six countries with NATO partner status under The Partnership Interoperability Initiative (PII). These countries make particularly significant contributions to NATO-led operations and other Alliance tasks.

*«...This status gives the country enhanced opportunities for dialogue and cooperation with Alliance member states*⁷.

Ukraine will have the main advantages in the field of national security by joining NATO.

First, we will ensure the protection of the national integrity and sovereignty of the Ukrainian state both externally and internally.

⁵ Vstup do NATO – stratehichnyi vybir Ukrainy [Joining NATO is a strategic choice for Ukraine], Institute of Transformation of Society, Kyiv 2020, p.115.

⁶ Rozvytok osoblyvoho partnerstva Ukrainy z NATO [Development of Ukraine's special partnership with NATO]; https://ukraine-nato.mfa.gov.ua/ukrayina-nato/rozvitok-osoblivogo-partnerstva-ukrayini-z-nato, accessed: 14.11.2021.

⁷ O. Aleksandrov, Ukraina – NATO: novi umovy ta realii spivrobitnytstva: analit. dop. [Ukraine – NATO: new conditions and realities of cooperation: analyst. ext], NISD Kyiv 2018, p. 33.

Secondly, Ukraine's opinion will always be taken into account during making decisions of international importance, as they are adopted by all NATO countries consensus. And this principle of the Alliance is not just declared, but works effectively.

Third, the development of Ukraine's defence-industrial complex will receive a significant boost.

Fourth, Ukraine will be able to begin the active phase of professional army forming. «...Our officers will be able to study at the best military academies in Europe and the United States, and highly qualified personnel from NATO will work in Ukraine»⁸.

The mechanism for preparing Ukraine for joining the North Atlantic Alliance

The main practical mechanism for preparing Ukraine for joining the North Atlantic Alliance includes:

- The establishment of Coordinating Committee for Ukraine's Accession to NATO within the Cabinet of Ministers; it should be chaired by the Prime Minister; the Committee should include key ministers and the Head of the Secretariat;
- 2) The establishment of cooperation departments with the North Atlantic Alliance in each ministry, which should be headed by deputy ministers;
- 3) Launching a broad, comprehensive information campaign to discuss all issues of Ukraine's Euro-Atlantic integration;
- 4) The development of training courses on Euro-Atlantic topics for teaching process;
- 5) Allocation of funds in the State Budget for realization of informational, educational and training activity on Ukraine's accession to the North Atlantic Alliance;
- 6) Demonstration in the mass media the information of Ukraine's advantages in case of its accession to NATO;
- Regular conduction of municipal hearings, educational events at the level of local communities, and creation the departments for European and Euro-Atlantic integration in city executive committees;
- 8) Definition, declaration and fixing accordingly by political parties, and first of all parliamentary ones, their position on Ukraine's accession to the North Atlantic Alliance.

⁸ Spivrobitnytstvo z NATO: pravovi aspekty [Cooperation with NATO: legal aspects]; https://minjust.gov.ua/m/str_951, accessed: 14.11.2021.

Non-military methods of Ukraine-NATO cooperation

Thus, the prospects for a joint Ukraine-NATO response to hybrid threats by non-military methods can be specified in the following recommendations:

- 1. Ukraine's sovereignty and territorial integrity must be seen by NATO as the basis for security in Europe.
- 2. Intensification of contacts between parliamentarians from Ukraine and colleagues from Allied countries, both from the governing political forces and the opposition, on various issues, including those from the framework of the NATO-Ukraine Interparliamentary Council.
- 3. Involvement of NATO member countries in demining and economic reconstruction of the liberated and frontline territories of Donetsk and Luhansk regions will promote the development of cooperation in general.
- 4. In the energy sector, Ukraine and NATO should focus on protecting crucially important energy infrastructure, diversifying energy sources and ways of energy supply. «...the physical connection with the gas pipelines of Western Europe, as well as access to raw materials from Norway and The Middle East would reduce Ukraine's dependence on Russia»⁹.
- 5. To study and apply the experience of NATO member countries in the areas of hostilities in eastern Ukraine in maintaining the normal functioning of local people, combining it with practical assistance from the Alliance.
- 6. To ensure the information security, including by raising the awareness of the residents of NATO's neighbouring countries about real situation in Ukraine.
- 7. NATO should pay particular attention to building Ukraine's cyber defence capabilities and joint countering and stopping those people, who involved in supporting terrorist activities.
- 8. Ukraine should approve the necessary law as soon as possible to implement the humanitarian mine action system according to the International Mine Action Standards (IMAS).
- 9. Ukraine should join to the work of NATO's centres of excellence, primarily in «...energy security (Vilnius, Lithuania), cyber security (Tallinn, Estonia) and strategic communications (Riga, Latvia)»¹⁰.

⁹ Y. Muravska, Paradyhma rozvytku derzhavno-pravovoho rehuliuvannia oborony i bezpeky v Ievropejs'komu Soiuzi [The paradigm of development of state and legal regulation of defense and security in the European Union], Actual problems of jurisprudence, TNEU, Ternopil 2017, Issue 1 (9), p. 34.

¹⁰ Secretary General: NATO stands with Ukraine. NATO; https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news_188552.htm?selectedLocale=en, accessed: 14.11.2021.

- 10. The implementation of civil control system over the security sector in Ukraine by creating various platforms and filling them with effective actions to combat hybrid threats.
- 11. The establishment, with the support, of the *«...NATO-Ukraine Platform* on Countering *Hybrid Warfare*, as the key platform for engaging experts», should become an instrument of joint and comprehensive counteraction to the war unleashed by Russia.

Conclusions

For Ukraine, the country, which seeks to form an optimal model of national security and stable development of the region, the most acceptable solution is joining to the NATO. After all, this is the organization, which works to strengthen the security of the Euro-Atlantic community. In addition, at the present time, the Alliance pursues an "open door" policy towards new members, and appropriate programs have been developed for its implementation.

In perspective, deepened non-military cooperation with NATO will allow Ukraine to move closer to the Alliance's standards, carry out internal democratic transformations and increase the efficiency of our country's civilian security sectors. In addition, this aspect of cooperation will provide an opportunity for the majority of the Ukrainian population to experience directly its results and better understand the essence of the North Atlantic Treaty Organization.

* * *

NATO-Ukraine Cooperation as an Important Mechanism for Counteracting Hybrid Warfare

(Abstract)

The scientific issue of Ukraine-NATO cooperation as an important mechanism for combating hybrid warfare is particularly relevant and complicated. However the security is a key point. The aim of the article is to present specific features of non-military cooperation between Ukraine and NATO. Based on the long-term goal of joining to the European system of collective security, Ukraine is building new approaches to ensuring national security.

The purpose of this article is to review the literature topic, as well as the current situation of Ukraine-NATO cooperation, the hybrid warfare, as well as additional and alternative forms of security policy. In this paper we attempt to determine the factors of Ukraine-NATO cooperation, the conditions, the advantages and disadvantages of current solutions, as well as the conclusion of present situation with the issuance of diagnosis for the future mechanism for combating hybrid warfare. The article uses the reports and results of selected studies conducted in Ukraine.

Bibliography

- Abramov V., Borysevych S., Datsiuk A., Zabezpechennia natsionalnoi bezpeky Ukrainy v umovakh vkhodzhennia Ukrainy do Yevropeiskoho ta Yevroatlantychnoho prostoriv: monohrafiia [Ensuring the national security of Ukraine in terms of Ukraine's entry into the European and Euro-Atlantic spaces: a monograph], NADU, Kyiv 2019, 110 p.
- Aleksandrov O., Ukraina NATO: novi umovy ta realii spivrobitnytstva: analit. dop. [Ukraine NATO: new conditions and realities of cooperation: analyst. ext], NISD, Kyiv 2018, 56 p.
- Andrushkiv B., Vivchar O., Problemy teorii i praktyky menedzhmentu : navch.-metodych. posibn. [Problems of theory and practice of management textbook]. Terno-Graf LLC, Ternopil 2009, 312 p.
- Martynyuk V., Muravska Y., Forming a foreign trade partnership strategy in the context of strengthening national economic security: A case study of Ukraine, "Forum Scientiae Oeconomia", Warszawa, 2020, Vol 8 No 2 (2020), p. 5-24; http://ojs.wsb.edu.pl/index.php/fso/article/view/296/237, accessed: 14.11.2021.
- Muravska Y., Paradyhma rozvytku derzhavno-pravovoho rehuliuvannia oborony i bezpeky v Ievropejs'komu Soiuzi [The paradigm of development of state and legal regulation of defense and security in the European Union], Actual problems of jurisprudence, TNEU, Ternopil 2017, Issue 1 (9), p. 30-35.
- Rozvytok osoblyvoho partnerstva Ukrainy z NATO [Development of Ukraine's special partnership with NATO]; https://ukraine-nato.mfa.gov.ua/ukrayina-nato/rozvitok-osoblivogo-partnerstva-ukrayini-z-nato, accessed: 14.11.2021.
- Secretary General: NATO stands with Ukraine. NATO; https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/ news_188552.htm?selectedLocale=en, accessed: 14.11.2021.
- Spivrobitnytstvo z NATO: pravovi aspekty [Cooperation with NATO: legal aspects]; https:// minjust.gov.ua/m/str_951, accessed: 14.11.2021.
- Vivchar O., Upravlinnia ekonomichnoiu bezpekoiu pidpryiemstv: sotsiohumanitarni konteksty [Management of economic security of enterprises: socio-humanitarian contexts], FOP Palianytsia, Ternopil 2018, 515 p.
- Vstup do NATO stratehichnyi vybir Ukrainy [Joining NATO is a strategic choice for Ukraine], Institute of Transformation of Society, Kyiv 2020, 192 p.